

Quality Assurance and Compliance Onsite Monitoring Visit for Career and Technical Education

Florida Gateway College

November 27–29, 2017

Final Report



State Board of Education

Marva Johnson, *Chair* Andy Tuck, *Vice Chair Members* Gary Chartrand Ben Gibson Tom Grady Michael Olenick Joe York Pam Stewart Commissioner of Education

Rod Duckworth, Chancellor Division of Career and Adult Education

January 30, 2018

Dr. Lawrence Barrett, President Florida Gateway College 149 S.E. College Place Lake City, FL 32025

Dear Dr. Barrett:

We are pleased to provide you with the final monitoring report for the career and technical education programs at Florida Gateway College. The final report will also be placed on the Quality Assurance and Compliance website at <u>http://fldoe.org/academics/career-adult-edu/compliance</u>.

We appreciate the leadership and professionalism demonstrated by your staff during our visit. If we can be of any assistance, please contact Tashi D. Williams, director of Quality Assurance and Compliance, at 850-245-9033 or <u>Tashi.Williams@fldoe.org</u>.

Thank you for your continuous commitment to improve educational services for Florida's students.

Sincerely,

Rod Duckworth

RD/ls

Enclosure

cc: Brian Dopson, vice president, Academic Programs, Florida Gateway College Michelle Holloway, vice president, Business Services, Florida Gateway College Gloria Spradley-Brown, bureau chief, Grants Administration and Compliance Tashi D. Williams, director, Quality Assurance and Compliance LaStacia Spencer, program specialist, Quality Assurance and Compliance Michael Swift, program specialist, Quality Assurance and Compliance

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Introduction	1
II.	Authority	1
III.	Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols	1
IV.	Provider Selection	1
V.	Florida Gateway College	2
VI.	Monitoring Activities	2
VII.	Results	3
VIII.	Required Resolution Activities	9
IX.	Summary	9
	Appendix A	10

Florida Department of Education Division of Career and Adult Education

Florida Gateway College Career and Technical Education Quality Assurance and Compliance Monitoring Report

I. INTRODUCTION

The Florida Department of Education (FDOE), Division of Career and Adult Education (division), in carrying out its roles of leadership, resource allocation, technical assistance, monitoring and evaluation, is required to oversee the performance and regulatory compliance of recipients of federal and state funding. The Quality Assurance and Compliance (QAC) section is responsible for the design, development, implementation and evaluation of a comprehensive system of quality assurance including monitoring. The role of the quality assurance system is to assure financial accountability, program quality and regulatory compliance. As stewards of federal and state funds, it is incumbent upon the division to monitor the use of workforce education funds and regulatory compliance of providers on a regular basis.

II. AUTHORITY

The FDOE receives federal funding from the U.S. Department of Education (USDOE) for Career and Technical Education (CTE) under the Carl D. Perkins (Perkins) Career and Technical Education Act of 2006, and for Adult Education (AE) under the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) of 2014. FDOE awards sub-grants to eligible providers to administer local programs. FDOE must monitor providers to ensure compliance with federal requirements, including Florida's approved state plans for CTE and Adult Education/Family Literacy. Each state shall have procedures for reviewing and approving applications for sub-grants and amendments to those applications, for providing technical assistance, for evaluating projects, and for performing other administrative responsibilities the state has determined are necessary to ensure compliance with applicable statutes and regulations pursuant to 34 CFR 76.770, Education Department General Administrative Regulations (EDGAR) and the Uniform Grant Guidance (UGG) for grant awards issued on or after December 26, 2014. The Florida Department of Education, Division of Career and Adult Education, is required to oversee the performance of sub-grantees in the enforcement of all laws and rules (Sections 1001.03(8) and 1008.32, Florida Statutes).

Additional citations noting pertinent laws and regulations and authority to monitor are located in the 2017-2018 Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols, Module A, Section 1.

III. QUALITY ASSURANCE POLICIES, PROCEDURES AND PROTOCOLS

The Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures and Protocols manual was revised in the 2017-18 program year. The manual is provided to each provider prior to the monitoring visit. The manual provides a summary of each facet of the monitoring design and the process. It also contains protocols that may be used as agencies are monitored or reviewed. References may be made to the manual in this document; it is located on the division's website at http://fldoe.org/academics/career-adult-edu/compliance.

IV. PROVIDER SELECTION

Various sources of data are used throughout the implementation of the quality assurance system. The monitoring component of the system is risk-based. Risk assessment is a process used to evaluate variables associated with the grants and assign a rating for the level of risk to the department and the division. A

risk matrix, identifying certain operational risk factors is completed for each provider. The risk matrix for each program monitored is located in Appendix A. The results of the risk assessment process and consideration of available resources are used to determine one or more appropriate monitoring strategy(ies) to be implemented.

The Quality Assurance and Compliance section may apply any specific monitoring strategy to any federal or state-funded provider at any time. There may be circumstances that may warrant onsite monitoring, desk monitoring review or other strategies regardless of a provider's risk matrix score.

The monitoring strategy for the Florida Gateway College (FGC) was determined to be an onsite visit. Notification was sent to Dr. Lawrence Barrett, president, on August 23, 2017. The designated representatives for the agency were Dr. Brian Dopson, Vice President of Academic Programs and Ms. Michelle Holloway, Vice President for Business Services.

The onsite visit to the agency was conducted November 27, 2017 through November 29, 2017. The two representatives of the division present during the visit were program specialists, Ms. LaStacia Spencer and Mr. Michael Swift of the Quality Assurance and Compliance section.

V. FLORIDA GATEWAY COLLEGE

ENROLLMENT:

<u>Fiscal Year (FY) 2015-16</u> CTE (possible duplication at program level) 2,047

The provider was awarded the following grants for FY's 2015-16, 2016-17 and 2017-18:

FY 2015-16 <u>Grants</u> Perkins CTE Postsecondary Perkins CTE Rural	<u>Grant Number</u> 122-1616A-6CP01 122-1616A-6CR01	<u>Grant Amount</u> \$ 259,373.00 \$ 91,897.00	<u>Unexpended</u> \$ 5,337.00 \$ 1,119.70
FY 2016-17 <u>Grants</u> Perkins CTE Postsecondary Perkins CTE Rural	<u>Grant Number</u> 122-1617A-7CP01 122-1617A-7CR01	<u>Grant Amount</u> \$ 271,409.00 \$ 91,420.00	<u>Unexpended</u> \$ 48,844.55 \$ 2,698.44
FY 2017-18 Grants Perkins CTE Postsecondary Perkins CTE Rural	<u>Grant Number</u> 122-1618A-8CP01 122-1618A-8CR01	Grant Amount \$ 265,877.00 \$ 91,226.00	Unexpended N/A N/A

Additional information about the provider may be found at the following web address: https://www.fgc.edu/

VI. MONITORING ACTIVITIES

The monitoring activities included pre and post visit planning, an entrance and exit conference, records review, inventory review and interviews with administrators.

Onsite Visits

Members of the team made onsite visits to the following locations:

- FGC Main Campus,
- FGC Public Service Training Campus

Entrance and Exit Conferences

The entrance conference for FGC was conducted on November 27, 2017. The exit conference was conducted on November 29, 2017. The participants are listed below:

Name	Title	Entrance Conference	Exit Conference
Brian Dopson	Vice President, Academic Programs	X	Х
Michelle Holloway	Vice President, Business Services	Х	Х
Paula Gavin	Dean, Academic Programs and Baccalaureate Liaison	Х	Х
Melody Corso	Executive Director, Nursing and Health Sciences	X	
John Jewett	Executive Director, Technology Programs and Public Service Programs	X	Х
Holly Sutton	Bursar	X	Х
FDOE Monitoring Team			
LaStacia Spencer	Program Specialist, QAC, FDOE	X	Х
Michael Swift	Program Specialist, QAC, FDOE	Х	Х

Interviews

Interviews were conducted with the administrative staff. All interviews were held during the course of the visit.

Records Review

Program, financial, administrative and student records were reviewed. A complete list is provided in section VII, item F. A minimum of 20 student records were reviewed. Policies and procedures were reviewed and discussed at various times during the visit.

VII. RESULTS

- A. <u>ADMINISTRATION:</u> refers to the management and/or supervision of programs, structure of programs and services, grant oversight and other administrative areas.
 - Many of the staff on the administration team is new within their position; however, they are knowledgeable of CTE programs and state and federal grant requirements.
 - Administration is dedicated to fulfilling the needs within the local workforce through the expansion of programs that can really make a difference in the community.
 - Professional development opportunities are offered to all staff within the college and participation in conferences is encouraged, as funding allows.
 - There were no instances of fraudulent activities reported during this monitoring review.

- **B.** <u>**DATA AND ASSESSMENT:**</u> refers to all the components of the data and assessment system, including test administration, test security, data collection and entry and reporting, as well as procedures. The use of data in program decision-making is also explored and commented upon.
 - FGC utilizes BANNER® for the collection of various student data.
 - FGC utilizes the Test for Adult Basic Education (TABE) and Postsecondary Education Readiness Test (PERT) tests for students enrolling into the college. Students are required to test prior to registering for classes.
 - CTE student data (including program completers and industry certifications) were verified during the course of the visit.
 - Data staff and administration regularly attend the Management Information Systems Advisory Taskforce (MISATFOR) meetings held by FDOE.
 - The reports specialist is well trained and receives few reporting errors from data submitted to FDOE. However, the monitoring team did advise staff to develop written procedures for data collection and reporting in order to assist with succession planning.
- C. <u>CURRICULUM AND INSTRUCTION:</u> refers to those elements that contribute to student learning and skill acquisition.
 - Program reviews are conducted annually in order to improve current programs being offered.
 - Dual enrollment is offered for local high school students. FGC is studying current GPA requirements for dual enrollment students in order to increase the number of minority students within the programs.
 - The Fire Academy had 100% job placement for the first graduating class.
 - State of the art equipment is being used in the classrooms to ensure that student learning is aligned with industry standards.
- **D.** <u>**TECHNOLOGY AND EQUIPMENT:**</u> refers to a review of the technology and equipment used by students and instructors in the classroom; addresses access, availability, innovation, use and condition.
 - Equipment purchased with grant funds were verified during the course of the visit and followed UGG standards.
 - All equipment purchased over the \$1,000 threshold is required to be tagged with a property decal.
 - Inventory is conducted on an annual basis.
 - The agency has established procedures for inventory management.
 - The equipment and teaching materials used in the classrooms are current and adequate for the number of students.
- E. <u>ACCESS AND EQUITY:</u> refers to compliance with the requirements of federal nondiscrimination laws as relating to recruitment, enrollment, participation and completion of programs.
 - The Office of Equal Educational Opportunity (OEEO) for colleges is responsible for monitoring and overseeing civil rights compliance obligations. Should you have any questions or concerns, please contact the OEEO at 850-245-9468.
- **F.** <u>**RECORDS REVIEW:**</u> refers to a review of the records and documents that evidence compliance with federal and state rules and regulations. Samples of financial and programmatic records are reviewed.

- FGC's Policies and Procedures:
 - Grant Administration
 - Advisory Committees
 - Improper Activities Policy
 - Travel and Per Diem
 - Purchasing, Competitive Solicitations and Contracts
 - College Property
 - o Conflict of Interest for Grant Awards
- Promotional Program Material
- TABE Test Administrator Certifications
- Testing Center Guidelines
- Inventory Records and Supporting Documents
- Program Advisory Committee Meeting Agendas and Minutes
- Student Records
- Financial Records (Travel, Purchasing and Procurement)
- Verification of a sample of Student Industry Certifications
- Verification of a sample of PSAV and PSV Program Completers
- Personnel Activity Reports (PAR)
- College Website
- **G. <u>FINANCIAL</u>:** refers to aspects of the federal fiscal requirements that providers must meet when expending federal funds, including financial management, procurement, inventory management and allowable costs.
 - FGC utilizes BANNER® for monitoring the financial process. Grant expenditures are reconciled monthly, sometimes weekly, to ensure that spending is aligned with what has been approved by FDOE.
 - FGC has established policies and procedures for cash management regarding grant funds that include purchasing and procurement, allowability of costs, travel, conflict of interest and fraud disclosure that are available on the website.
 - The monitoring team verified that the proper procedures were taking place in approving grant funded travel expenses.
 - The monitoring team also reviewed requisition data, purchase orders and travel request documents and found these documents to be in accordance with federal, state and college policies.
- **H.** <u>COLLABORATION:</u> refers to the collaborative agreements, partnerships or memoranda of understanding (MOU) that are in place to benefit an agency's programs and students.
 - FGC has strong partnerships with area business and industry organizations, corporations and public service departments that serve as guest speakers, advisory board members and provide internship opportunities for students.
 - FGC has dual enrollment articulation agreements with the following school districts:
 - o Columbia County
 - o Dixie County
 - Gilchrist County
 - Hamilton County
 - Suwannee County
 - Union County

- I. <u>PERKINS LOCAL PROGRAM IMPROVEMENT PLAN</u>: A Perkins local PIP is required when an agency does not meet 90% of its agreed-upon goals for individual performance measures.
 - The monitoring team met with administration to discuss current and future strategies regarding the Perkins core measure 5P1: Nontraditional Enrollment, in which 90% attainment was not satisfied in 2015-16.
 - FGC has implemented several strategies in order to recruit students into all programs, especially those that are nontraditional. These strategies center on informing not only potential students of programs that are being offered but also parents, friends and the community as a whole, since word of mouth is a major factor in a student's decision to enroll at FGC. Events that take place include presentations at area high schools, participation at career fairs and targeted events held at the college, such as their "Tech Divas" day, that grants young female students access to science, technology, engineering and mathematics (STEM) related programs that are offered. FGC has also recently updated its marketing material.
 - The monitoring team feels that the administration is making the necessary steps towards improvement upon this measure.

Postsecondary Certificate Performance Indicators 2015-16

In 2015-16, the agency met or exceeded all Postsecondary Certificate measures. Therefore, a PIP was not required.

Postsecondary College Credit Performance Indicators 2015-16

In 2015-16, the agency met or exceeded all postsecondary measures except for the following. Therefore, a PIP was required:

- 5P1 Non-traditional Enrollment: Local Actual of 22.93% vs. Local Agreed of 28.25%
- J. <u>PROGRAMS OF STUDY</u>: As part of the new DCAE assistance process, all agencies selected for a monitoring visit each project year will receive special technical assistance on Programs of Study (POS) and their development and implementation. The section of the monitoring protocol concerning POS has been expanded and the narrative and supporting materials for this section were collected prior to the onsite visit. During the monitoring visit to FGC, Cathy Hammond, Bruce Harrington and Heather Conley from the Federal and State Initiatives (FSI) section of the DCAE conducted a conference call to review the previously submitted POS narrative with FGC staff on Monday, November 27, 2017. A summary of the conference call discussion compiled by the FSI team appears below.

Logistics (Secondary)/Supply Chain Mgmt. (AS) or Transportation and Logistics (AS) (Postsecondary)

Development and Implementation of POS

- The Logistics and Supply Chain programs were developed due to the planned development of an industrial park in the region, the North Florida Intermodal Park. However, Park development has been delayed indefinitely due to a change in ownership and negotiations for the development of a rail spur to go to the Park.
- Enrollment in 2015-16 in Logistics and Transportation (CCC) was four. There was no enrollment during that year in one of the AS degree programs listed on the submitted POS form. This AS program in Supply Chain Management has been suspended and some students are in teach-out.
- This was a well thought out program of study but very dependent on the completion of the promised industrial park. Staff indicated that FGC does not currently have any plans to restart

this program, but they envision it could be started in the future, dependent upon relevant employers entering the region.

- The Logistics program suffers due to a need for more employers within 30-40 miles of campus. Students in this program often are looking at opportunities in Jacksonville or other larger geographic areas for jobs in this program area.
- The secondary Logistics program had solid enrollments in both Baker and Columbia counties in 2015-16. The programs continue, but they are primarily aimed at filling floor worker openings at regional warehouses like US Cold Storage, Target and Walmart. Students do not all pass the entry tests required for the postsecondary programs but may find employment.

Student Outcomes

- In 2015-16, there were more challenges in meeting measures in the Supply Chain Management program (also a small program) than the Logistics program. The program did not meet any measures, based on overall local targets, for the 2015-16 project year.
- Staff shared that students have challenges completing early level courses in this program because they are lacking math and work-study skills. Students need 12th grade math to be successful as well as good work-study skills. These problems result in students not completing the early courses, but they may complete enough to be a concentrator prior to leaving the program (adversely impacting performance on this measure). FGC has tried to address these issues with personal in-class study guides and by encouraging remedial math courses.
- Another challenge is that students carry heavy employment workloads on top of coursework. This challenge is exacerbated during the holiday season when up to 10 hour shifts are required by local warehousing employers. Employment workloads often result in a low level of commitment to program completion work is more important than school.
- The students are relating to instructors that actual coursework is meshing well with experience in the workplace.

Challenges to CTE POS Implementation

Serving Rural Areas

- FGC serves five rural counties with large percentages of low income individuals and families, with some of the highest percentages in the state. Perkins can help low income students. However, they have unique challenges, and FGC is trying to help them.
- One challenge is local access to high-speed internet. It is not available in two of their partner counties. This impacts the ability to complete courses. It also means that without regular access, these students have trouble adjusting to using technology in the workplace.
- Lack of local employers can also impact program enrollment and completion as students may have to look for employment opportunities in various program areas in larger, more populated geographic areas.
- Additionally, retention is a challenge as it is in all colleges in Florida.

Rapid Changes in Technology

- Staff shared there have been great changes in technology in the field of Logistics in the last five years, with an increase in automation/robotics. As a result, courses in their IT career cluster are getting beefed up in software skills, resulting in more cooperation between IT and Logistics faculty.
- Warehouse jobs that do not employ considerable tech skills are vanishing.
- These rapid changes in technology are also happening in banking and other areas.
- Rapid changes in technology make it difficult to develop programs that are currently relevant to local industry. It takes about two years to go from program concept to

program implementation. But often by that time, different technology is being used and the program coursework is out of date.

Secondary and Postsecondary Relationships:

- The secondary Logistics program articulates to FGC's Logistics and Supply Chain Management programs through the Global Logistics Certificate (GLA). Secondary students who pass the exam earn credits at the college (number of college credits not specified on the call). FGC took in secondary Logistics Academy completers, who could complete the GLA certification or could go on into the CCC or four-year programs.
- In January 2016 advisory council minutes, the high school representatives noted that they did not expect many secondary students in Logistics to move on to programs in postsecondary. FGC staff explained that secondary program completers can find jobs without any postsecondary training and make pretty good money, but those that do hold certificates can move up in the organizations faster, especially if they have experience with technology. Many of these students want hands-on jobs and can get them with a high school diploma and no certification.
- Staff on the call said they had approximately 10 students transition into this postsecondary program from secondary in 2014. In 2015, only three made the transition. Students usually went into the Supply Chain AS degree program and could achieve the Logistics CCC in the course of enrollment in the AS program.
- Staff reported that they had a high transfer rate to more higher education, most of which appeared to be from their AA degree programs. It was not clear how many overall from AS degree programs transferred to gain more postsecondary education.
- FGC staff said the BAS program has been developed but shelved at this time. It is state approved but they need a local catalyst to launch it. This BAS would only be offered online.

Advisory Councils and Collaboration with Local Business/Industry

- FGC staff said they have retained some of the members of this Industry Advisory Committee for Logistics and Supply Chain Mgmt. But since there has been no need to meet, they have not had any meetings since it began teach-out status.
- FGC staff shared that every program has a council, but not necessarily for each individual program. A few programs, like those dealing with the nursing trades, are combined. They felt there was no difficulty obtaining members for their Industry Advisory Committees. Students are not directly involved in these committee meetings, but in some areas, like the Health Committee, they are invited to attend.
- Local industries are heavily dependent on FGC for offering programs meeting their labor needs.

Program Review

- Enrollment is a factor in all program reviews. A review is made of jobs available locally to make sure there is demand.
- Programs are constantly being informally reviewed and they try to keep up with changing tech needs of industry.
- Every five years each program goes through a formal review. However, this year a new process has been introduced where programs will be undergoing an annual review on a staggered basis.
- FGC programs also receive feedback from their accrediting body.

Programs of Study Overall

• When asked to define a program of study, FGC staff explained that they believe it is a clearly defined curriculum that aims at helping students be successful in further study or

achieve gainful employment. On the occupation side, it is a clearly designed program to help students get gainful employment. All programs at FGC would be programs of study but since AA programs are designed to prepare students for higher education, students in these programs would require further training.

- FGC promotes their CTE programs to students, parents and the community in many ways, including career fairs at high schools, classroom visits, college nights, website, outreach emails and brochures sent to students/families. Their efforts also include targeting females to consider non-traditional occupational fields, such as their "Tech Divas" initiative to draw female high school students to STEM fields. College recruiters go into high schools and educate students about their options.
- When asked about the perception of CTE in the region, staff on the call felt that a lot of people were aware of their CTE programs and that they have a good reputation with high school teachers. FGC staff on the call said they were proud of their institution's accomplishment of a recent 20% increase in enrollment. They felt that this increase in enrollment was due to a changed approach to promotion of the school, plus both the streamlining of the admissions and financial aid processes and making financial aid more available.

Final Thoughts from FGC

• Staff on the call felt that their new team is working well together and they have plans to strengthen and build healthy, strong programs that benefit students and have a positive local impact. FGC is much stronger in this area and they are really proud of that fact. Their focus is to try to make sure that students are successful.

VIII. REQUIRED RESOLUTION ACTIVITIES

CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION

1. Corrective Action Plan – Florida Gateway College is not required to complete a CTE Corrective Action Plan.

IX. SUMMARY

Once the fieldwork is completed, including receipt of requested information when applicable, a preliminary report is forwarded to the provider for review. Comments are accepted and considered at the discretion of the FDOE Quality Assurance and Compliance section. The final report is completed, forwarded to the agency head with a copy to the appropriate parties, and is posted on the department's website at the following address: http://fldoe.org/academics/career-adult-edu/compliance.

Finally, the division issues a closure notice to the agency head and designated contact person. This notice indicates that all outstanding resolution items have been completed when applicable or that no further action is required.

On behalf of the department, the monitoring team extends our appreciation to all participants in the FGC onsite monitoring visit. Special thanks are offered to Dr. Brian Dopson and Ms. Michelle Holloway for their participation and leadership during this process.

APPENDIX A

Florida Gateway College Career and Technical Education Risk Matrix

Risk Scores Matrix for Districts Receiving Career and Technical Education (CTE) Carl D. Perkins Grants

Agency Name: **FLORIDA GATEWAY COLLEGE** Program type: **CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION** Target Year: **2015-2016** Monitoring Year: **2017-2018**

Metric	Scaling	Point Value	Points Assigned	Weight	Total Metric Points	
Last Monitored	7 years or more	7	7	<u>X 10</u>	70	
	5-6 years	5				
Last Wollitor eu	3-4 years	3				
	0-2 years	1				
	Upper Quartile	7	_		40	
T- 4- 1 D 1 D 1 4	Upper Middle	5		<u>X8</u>		
Total Perkins Budget Allocated Value	Lower Middle	3	5			
Allocated value	Lower Quartile	1				
	4+	7		<u>X 8</u>	8	
# Perkins Grants	3	5				
Value	2	3	1			
	1	1				
	7.50 - 10.00	7			8	
	5.00 - 7.49	5		<u>X 8</u>		
Perkins PIP Index	2.50 - 4.99	3	1			
Value	0 <index<2.50< td=""><td>1</td><td rowspan="2">-</td></index<2.50<>	1	-			
	0	0				
Perkins	Yes	7				
Director Change Value	No	0	7	<u>X 6</u>	42	
	Upper Quartile	7	0			
Perkins Funds	Upper Middle	5				
Remaining Point	Lower Middle	3		0	<u>X 4</u>	0
Value	Lower Quartile	1				
	0	0				
	Upper Quartile	7	5			
	Upper Middle	5				
OAG Findings Value	Lower Middle	3		<u>X 4</u>	20	
0	Lower Quartile	1		-		
	0	0				
		A	GENCY RISK	SCORE:	188	

*Data sources used for calculations: Prior to July 1, 2016