



**Quality Assurance and Compliance
Onsite Monitoring Visit
for
Adult Education and Career and Technical Education**

Miami Dade College

January 23 – 27, 2017

Final Report



State Board of Education

Marva Johnson, *Chair*
Andy Tuck, *Vice Chair*
Members
Gary Chartrand
Tom Grady
Rebecca Fishman Lipsey
Michael Olenick

Pam Stewart
Commissioner of Education

Rod Duckworth, Chancellor
Division of Career and Adult Education

April 6, 2017

Dr. Eduardo J. Padron, President
Miami Dade College
300 Northeast 2nd Avenue
Miami, Florida 33132-2297

Dear Dr. Padron:

We are pleased to provide you with the final monitoring report for the adult education and career and technical education programs at Hillsborough County Public Schools. The final report will also be placed on the Quality Assurance and Compliance website at <http://fldoe.org/academics/career-adult-edu/compliance>.

We appreciate the leadership and professionalism demonstrated by your staff during our visit. If we can be of any assistance, please contact Tashi D. Williams, director of Quality Assurance and Compliance, at 850-245-9033 or Tashi.Williams@fldoe.org.

Thank you for your continuous commitment to improve educational services for Florida's students.

Sincerely,

Rod Duckworth

RD/mws

Enclosure

cc: Elias Reynoso, director, Career Technical and Education
Sherry Joseph-Dutton, director, Adult Education
Gloria Spradley-Brown, bureau chief, Grants Administration and Compliance
Tashi D. Williams, director, Quality Assurance and Compliance
Michael Swift, program specialist, Quality Assurance and Compliance

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. Introduction 1

II. Authority 1

III. Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols 1

IV. Provider Selection 1

V. Miami Dade College 2

VI. Monitoring Activities 2

VII. Results 4

VIII. Required Resolution Activities 12

IX. Summary 12

 Appendix A 13

 Appendix B 15

 Attachment 17

Florida Department of Education
Division of Career and Adult Education

Miami Dade College
Adult Education and Career and Technical Education
Quality Assurance and Compliance Monitoring Report

I. INTRODUCTION

The Florida Department of Education (FLDOE), Division of Career and Adult Education (division), in carrying out its roles of leadership, resource allocation, technical assistance, monitoring and evaluation, is required to oversee the performance and regulatory compliance of recipients of federal and state funding. The Quality Assurance and Compliance section is responsible for the design, development, implementation and evaluation of a comprehensive system of quality assurance including monitoring. The role of the quality assurance system is to assure financial accountability, program quality and regulatory compliance. As stewards of federal and state funds, it is incumbent upon the division to monitor the use of workforce education funds and regulatory compliance of providers on a regular basis.

II. AUTHORITY

The FLDOE receives federal funding from the U.S. Department of Education (USDOE) for Career and Technical Education (CTE) under the Carl D. Perkins (Perkins) Career and Technical Education Act of 2006, and for Adult Education (AE) under the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) of 2014. FLDOE awards sub-grants to eligible providers to administer local programs. FLDOE must monitor providers to ensure compliance with federal requirements, including Florida's approved state plans for CTE and Adult Education/Family Literacy. Each state shall have procedures for reviewing and approving applications for sub-grants and amendments to those applications, for providing technical assistance, for evaluating projects, and for performing other administrative responsibilities the state has determined are necessary to ensure compliance with applicable statutes and regulations pursuant to 34 CFR 76.770, Education Department General Administrative Regulations (EDGAR) and the Uniform Grant Guidance (UGG) for grant awards issued on or after December 26, 2014. The Florida Department of Education, Division of Career and Adult Education, is required to oversee the performance of sub-grantees in the enforcement of all laws and rules (Sections 1001.03(8) and 1008.32, Florida Statutes).

Additional citations noting pertinent laws and regulations and authority to monitor are located in the 2016-2017 Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols, Module A, Section 1.

III. QUALITY ASSURANCE POLICIES, PROCEDURES, AND PROTOCOLS

The Quality Assurance Policies, Procedures, and Protocols manual was revised in the 2016-17 program year. The manual is provided to each provider prior to the monitoring visit. The manual provides a summary of each facet of the monitoring design and the process. It also contains protocols that may be used as agencies are monitored or reviewed. References may be made to the manual in this document; it is located on the division's website at <http://fldoe.org/academics/career-adult-edu/compliance>.

IV. PROVIDER SELECTION

Various sources of data are used throughout the implementation of the quality assurance system. The monitoring component of the system is risk-based. Risk assessment is a process used to evaluate variables associated with the grants and assign a rating for the level of risk to the department and the division.

A risk matrix identifying certain operational risk factors is completed for each provider. The risk matrix for the CTE and AE programs are located in Appendix A. The results of the risk assessment process and consideration of available resources are used to determine one or more appropriate monitoring strategy(ies) to be implemented.

The monitoring strategy for Miami Dade College (MDC) was determined to be an onsite visit. Notification was sent to Dr. Eduardo J. Padron, president, Miami Dade College on November 21, 2016. The designated representatives for the agency were Mr. Elias Reynoso, director, Career and Technical Education and Mrs. Sherry Joseph-Dutton, director, Adult Education.

The onsite visit to the agency was conducted January 23 through January 27, 2017, by four representatives of the Quality Assurance and Compliance section of the division: Mr. Michael Swift, Ms. Ordania Jones and Dr. Shahrokh Massoudi, program specialists; and Mr. Tashi Williams, director.

V. MIAMI DADE COLLEGE

ENROLLMENT:

Fiscal Year (FY) 2014-15

AE	CTE
9,840	80,507 (possible duplication at program level)

The provider was awarded the following grants for fiscal years (FY) 2014-15, 2015-16 and 2016-17:

Finance:

FY 2014-15

<u>Grants</u>	<u>Grant Number</u>	<u>Grant Amount</u>	<u>Unexpended</u>
CTE Perkins Postsecondary	132-1615A-5CP01	\$2,733,140.00	\$ 0.00
Adult General Education	132-1915A-5CG01	\$2,224,969.00	\$ 0.00
EL Civics	132-1635A-5CE01	\$ 201,519.00	\$ 1.67

FY 2015-16

<u>Grants</u>	<u>Grant Number</u>	<u>Grant Amount</u>	<u>Unexpended</u>
CTE Perkins Postsecondary	132-1616A-6CP01	\$2,573,931.00	\$ 152,597.91
Adult General Education	132-1916B-6CG01	\$2,224,969.00	\$ 91,981.95
EL Civics	132-1636B-6CE01	\$ 201,519.00	\$ 0.00

FY 2016-17

<u>Grants</u>	<u>Grant Number</u>	<u>Grant Amount</u>	<u>Unexpended</u>
CTE Perkins Postsecondary	132-1617A-7CP01	\$2,521,774.00	N/A
Adult General Education	132-1917B-7CG01	\$2,224,969.00	N/A
EL Civics	132-1637B-7CE01	\$ 201,519.00	N/A

Additional information about the provider may be found at the following web address:

<http://www.mdc.edu>

VI. MONITORING ACTIVITIES

The monitoring activities included pre and post visit planning, an entrance and exit conference, classroom observations, records review, inventory review and interviews with administrators, instructors and students.

Onsite Visits

Members of the team made onsite visits to the following locations:

- Kendall Campus
- Medical Campus
- North Campus
- Wolfson Campus
- Miami International Airport
- Miami Executive Airport
- UNIDAD

Entrance and Exit Conferences

The entrance conference for MDC was conducted on January 23, 2017. The exit conference was conducted on January 27, 2017. The participants are listed below:

Name	Title	Entrance Conference	Exit Conference
Dr. Julie Alexander	Vice Provost, Academic Affairs	X	X
Archie Cubarrubia	Vice Provost, Institutional Effectiveness		X
Cheryl Baldwin	Dean, School of Continuing Education and Professional Development	X	X
Elias Reynoso	Director, Career and Technical Education	X	X
Sherry Joseph-Dutton	Director, Adult Education	X	X
Susana Vela	Director, Adult Education	X	
Luis M. Rodriguez	Program Director, Continuing Education		X
Youdoris Mira	Chair, Continuing Education	X	X
David Lotker	Chair, Continuing Education	X	
Barbara Alfonso	Chair, Continuing Education	X	
Karina Pavone	Chair, Continuing Education	X	X
FDOE Monitoring Team			
Tashi Williams	Director, Quality Assurance and Compliance	X	X
Michael Swift	Program Specialist, FLDOE	X	X
Ordania Jones	Program Specialist, FLDOE	X	X
Dr. Shahrokh Massoudi	Program Specialist, FLDOE	X	X

Interviews/Observations

Interviews were conducted with the administrative staff, instructional staff, program assessment and testing director and students. A minimum of two interviews and observations were completed at each site except at Medical Campus where team members only performed an inventory of equipment. All interviews were held during the course of the visit.

Records Review

Program, financial, administrative and student records were reviewed. A complete list is provided in section VII, item G. A minimum of 30 student records were reviewed. Policies and procedures were reviewed and discussed at various times during the visit.

VII. RESULTS

- A. ADMINISTRATION:** refers to the management and/or supervision of programs, structure of programs and services, grant oversight and other administrative areas.
- The AE administrators are well experienced and knowledgeable in their respective program areas.
 - MDC prides itself on being a mission driven college.
 - MDC offers continuous professional development and training related to AE and CTE.
 - In 2016, the AE program began requiring ten hours of preapproved professional development every two years for part time and full time instructors.
- B. DATA AND ASSESSMENT:** refers to all the components of the data and assessment system, including test administration, test security, data collection and entry and reporting, as well as procedures. The use of data in program decision-making is also explored and commented upon.
- The Institutional Research and Effectiveness (IRE) department has policies and procedures for program data collection, entry and reporting.
 - IRE presented the monitoring team with a comprehensive plan intended to increase the college's CTE performance measures. The plan is intended to review, reflect and refocus strategic methods aimed at increasing performance measures that have missed 90% attainment of goal for the past five years.
 - MDC is currently in the process of transitioning from Odyssey to the PeopleSoft Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) system.
 - Program administrators rely on data reports for annual program evaluation and improvement.
 - All eight MDC campuses are PearsonVue General Education Development (GED®) certified testing centers.
- C. CURRICULUM AND INSTRUCTION:** refers to those elements, which contribute to student learning and skill acquisition. It also addresses student and teacher observations.
- MDC offers flexible scheduling and an increasing number of online course offerings to accommodate the working student population that the college serves.
 - Instructors possess the necessary skills, education and work experience essential to teach AE and CTE courses.
 - MDC serves 10,000 Adult Education learners annually, including 80% English Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) students and 20% Adult General Education (AGE)/GED® students.

- The Career and Technical Student Organizations (CTSO) were observed conducting an on campus student recruitment event during the visit.
- MDC follows the state of Florida curriculum frameworks.
- Seven of the eight MDC campuses offer AE programs.

D. TECHNOLOGY AND EQUIPMENT: refers to a review of the technology and equipment used by students and teachers in the classroom; addresses access, availability, innovation, use and condition.

- Technology policies and procedures were reviewed and discussed with the FLDOE monitoring team regarding requisition and the purchasing of new equipment.
- CTE administrators are dedicated to providing technology training to staff in order to stay current with rapidly changing technology trends.
- Many programs utilize state of the art technology and equipment that mimics what students will use in the field once they have industry jobs.
- The college conducts annual inventory and reconciliation of equipment.
- The college has policies and procedures for lost, stolen or damaged equipment purchased with AE or CTE grant funds. The monitoring team was provided a stolen property report and the accompanying police report for a piece of stolen equipment.

FINDING AND CORRECTIVE ACTION

- Finding D1: The equipment inventory listing did not follow the rules and guidelines as specified in EDGAR (34 CFR 80.32 (d)(1)) and the UGG (200.313). At multiple CTE locations throughout the college the monitoring team observed numerous pieces of equipment/inventory that was not in the specified classroom or campus locations according to the provided inventory lists.

Dell Inspiron laptops purchased at North Campus with EL Civics funds were included in the inventory listings as AGE grant purchases. In addition, at the time of our visit to North Campus the laptops were not located at the campus as stated on the inventory listing. They were later found at two off campus ESOL locations.

Multiple pieces of CTE equipment at the Wolfson campus were located in different classrooms other than what was stated on the inventory listing.

- Wolfson Campus, room 2303 had multiple Dell Optiplex computers that were listed as being located in room 2318.
- Wolfson Campus, room 8314 had multiple WACOM systems that were listed as being located in room 7180.
- Wolfson Campus, room 7180 had additional WACOM systems that were listed as being located in room 8314.

Aviation equipment/inventory located at the Miami International Airport and the Miami Executive Airport is listed as being at the Homestead Campus.

- Corrective Action D1: The equipment inventory listings must follow the rules and guidelines as specified in EDGAR (34 CFR 80.32(d)(1)) and the UGG (200.313). Equipment/inventory listings must be updated to reflect its current location and/or custodian. A property transfer form must be used when moving equipment/inventory to reflect an items current location.

E. LEARNING ENVIRONMENT: encompasses all aspects of the physical environment where classes are held. Describing the learning environment may also attempt to capture the vision, philosophy and character that is observed on the campus or in the classroom.

- Campus ACCESS services provides approved accommodations for students who self-declare a disability during their registration process.
- The Idea Center provides free computer training, textbooks and other free student services.
- Most classes are spacious and accommodating for the students, instructors and equipment.

F. ACCESS AND EQUITY: refers to compliance with the requirements of federal non-discrimination laws as relating to recruitment, enrollment, participation and completion of programs.

- The Office of Equal Educational Opportunity (OEEEO) for colleges is responsible for monitoring and overseeing civil rights compliance obligations. Should you have any questions or concerns, please contact the OEEEO at 850-245-9468.

G. RECORDS REVIEW: refers to a review of the records and documents that evidence compliance with federal and state rules and regulations. Samples of financial and programmatic records are reviewed.

- Student handbook
- Employee handbook
- Theft of property report and accompanying police report
- Transfer of property forms
- Student registration/enrollment forms
- Financial policies and procedures
- MDC website
- Student attendance reports
- Verification of industry certification samples
- Verification of program completers and non-completers
- Advisory committees for Workforce Education procedures
- CTE Program Improvement Plans (PIPs)
- Promotional brochures and materials
- Grant project time and effort reports
- Professional development for adult educators policies and guidelines
- Data collection and assessment policies and procedures
- Class schedules
- Travel records
- New student enrollment and placement guidelines
- Perkins technical assistance and strategic plan for 2015-2020
- Procurement policies and procedures
- Inventory and property management policies and procedures

- Employee reimbursement forms

H. FINANCIAL: refers to aspects of the federal fiscal requirements that providers must meet when expending federal funds, including financial management, procurement, inventory management and allowable costs.

- MDC has thorough policies and procedures for its financial accounting systems.
- Current financial purchasing thresholds include: purchases up to \$25,000 require approval by the campus president or provost, purchases between \$25,000 and \$250,000 require a bid process and purchases above \$250,000 require approval from the board of directors.
- MDC has a comprehensive tracking system for AE and CTE grant funds.
- MDC follows policy guidelines and procedures for expenditure reporting.
- MDC has an accountability system in place to assure that grant expenditures are reasonable, allowable and allocable.

FINDING AND CORRECTIVE ACTION

- Finding H1: Multiple AE semi-annual certification reports were missing the appropriate signatures and/or dates of the employee and supervisor. UGG (200.430), FLDOE Green Book (Personnel Cost- Time Distribution, Section C-19).
 - Corrective Action H1: Employee semi-annual certification reports must be signed and dated by the employee and supervisor after the work has been performed. UGG (200.430), FLDOE Green Book (Personnel Cost- Time Distribution, Section C-19).

I. COLLABORATION: refers to the collaborative agreements, partnerships, or memoranda of understanding (MOU) that are in place to benefit an agency's programs and students.

MDC has collaborative agreements with the following:

- CareerSource South Florida
- Adults Mankind Organization, Inc. (AMO)
- Community Coalition, Inc.
- Cuban American National Council, Inc. (CNC)
- Youth Co-Op, Inc.
- Refugee/Entrant Vocational Education Services and Training program (REVEST)
- Ramtech Construction
- South Florida Hispanic Chamber of Commerce
- Single Stop USA
- Miami Center for Architecture and Design
- Florida Customs Brokers and Forwarders Association
- Fred Hunter Funeral Home
- St. Port Funeral Home
- Environmental Education Providers
- Baptist Health Centers
- Miami Zoo
- Miami Dade Animal Services
- PIXAR Renderman
- Manchester Metropolitan University

- Miami Rescue Mission Clinic

J. PERKINS LOCAL PROGRAM IMPROVEMENT PLAN: A Perkins local PIP is required when an agency does not meet 90% of its agreed-upon goals for individual performance measures.

- PIPs for performance measures where the agency met less than 90% of their negotiated target were reviewed and discussed with the monitoring team.
- The CTE director and the vice provost of IRE met with the FLDOE monitoring team to discuss strategies that the college will implement to increase future performance measure gains.
- MDC is working with program advisory boards, industry leaders and other stakeholders in the community to assist with evaluating the effectiveness of these new strategies in regards to increasing performance measure gains.

Postsecondary college credit measures:

- In 2014-15 the agency met or exceeded all postsecondary college credit measures except for the following, therefore a PIP was required:
 - 2P1 Completion: Local Actual of 39.12% vs. Local Agreed of 54.55%
 - 5P2 Non-traditional completion: Local Actual of 23.16% vs. Local Agreed of 33.75%

Postsecondary certificate measures:

- In 2014-15 the agency met or exceeded all postsecondary certificate measures except for the following, therefore a PIP was required:
 - 1A1 Technical skills: Local Actual of 77.32% vs. Local Agreed of 83.00%
 - 2A1 Completion: Local Actual of 54.31% vs. Local Agreed of 68.23%
 - 3A1 Retention or transfer: Local Actual of 47.92% vs. Local Agreed of 72.16%
 - 5A1 Non- traditional enrollment: Local Actual of 21.92% vs. Local Agreed of 25.22%
 - 5A2 Non- traditional completion: Local Actual of 31.85% vs. Local Agreed of 47.46%

K. STUDENT PERSPECTIVE: The team met with groups of students; their perspective is presented as a portion of this report.

- MDC had eight ESOL students whose essays were recently published in the Florida Literacy Coalition’s “Voices” book.
- Many students were appreciative of the multitude of student support services.
- Students are thankful for the flexible scheduling of program offerings.
- Students enjoy the benefit of having “in house” academic advisors that are knowledgeable in specific program areas.
- Students were impressed with the quality of equipment and technology that is used in the classroom.

- L. **PROGRAMS OF STUDY:** As part of the new Division of Career and Adult Education (DCAE) assistance process, all agencies selected for a monitoring visit each project year will receive special technical assistance on Programs of Study (POS) and their development and implementation. The section of the monitoring protocol concerning POS has been expanded and the narrative and supporting materials for this section were collected prior to the onsite visit. During the monitoring visit to MDC, Cathy Hammond, Bruce Harrington and Erin Sampson from the Federal and State Initiatives (FSI) section of the DCAE discussed via a conference call, submitted narrative and materials on POS with MDC staff on Tuesday, January 24, 2017. A summary of the conference call discussion compiled by the FSI team appears below.

Building Construction Technology AS Program of Study

Identification and Development of this POS

- Since its 1974 inception, the program has evolved throughout the years to support the needs/gaps in skills of workers in the local labor market and offer certifications in construction, architecture and building technologies.
- MDC reviewed demographics in the local labor force to assist in identifying the program and the current needs to support the interest in modular home building, manufacturing and safety protocols. The associate dean suggested that MDC has to work on looking more closely at labor needs and creating solutions to bridge the language barriers of students, which are impacting student retention. (Note: MDC has begun 6 a.m. ESOL classes for students.)
- MDC was awarded a federal grant to develop a TRAMCON program. This non-college credit program will assist students; particularly those already employed in construction, in meeting skills requirements in Manufactured Construction. The development of an on-ramp for students from the pre-fab TRAMCON program into the Building Construction Technology AS program and other related programs are in future plans for MDC.

Program Outcomes for this POS

- The primary POS, Building Construction Technology AS, submitted with the MDC 2014-15 Perkins application, has had continuing challenges in meeting Perkins performance measures. Although MDC presented no hard data about the causes of these challenges, it was the opinion of staff present on the call that the following were potential contributing factors impacting performance on outcomes for this specific POS:
 - Finding qualified faculty (with a Master's degree or instructional experience).
 - Students not completing or passing courses, which may be due to a lack of college readiness or language barriers.
 - Students only taking courses to build professional skills and leaving to attain employment before completing the program.

Addendum: In an email after reviewing the draft report, the vice provost for Academic Affairs at MDC, who was not on the conference call, added that “while it may be that the above list of possible factors have an impact on student performance in the AS in Building Construction Technology, it is important to emphasize that these are generalized statements that are not based on an analysis of data. In an effort to better understand student performance and success factors, MDC has developed a research agenda for students whose first language is not English and will incorporate a CTE strand in the research plan.”

- To address the issue of low college readiness skills, MDC plans to institute an online program in the fall of 2017, which will be an 18 credit certificate on Building Construction to build foundational skills to help students find employment.
- In addressing questions about Perkins performance measures, the associate dean was not in a position to address Perkins performance measures or data reports related to Perkins as this is beyond his scope of responsibilities. In an effort to improve performance, MDC plans to actively reach out to stakeholders (the community and students) to get feedback on challenges to the program. After further discussing the Perkins measures, the CTE director wants to begin to give Perkins performance data to program managers for review of the status of student outcomes.

Addendum: In an email after reviewing the draft report, the vice provost for Academic Affairs at MDC clarified that a number of MDC staff and administrators were informed of Perkins performance measures and accountability through a campus-wide training delivered in November of 2016.

Secondary and Postsecondary Collaboration

- There is no established articulation between the district technical centers and MDC, but articulation is established with Miami-Dade Public Schools (secondary).
- MDC reported that a large percentage (59%-61%) of high school students go on to enroll at the college. However, staff present on the call asserted that very few students are specifically entering the Building Construction Technology AS POS from the secondary program. MDC recently transitioned to a new data tracking system, but the system will not filter by programs to verify the number of secondary POS students entering the postsecondary POS at MDC.

Addendum: In an email after reviewing the draft report, the MDC vice provost for Academic Affairs emphasized that the above point was the opinion of the staff present on the call and that MDC was, in fact, “engaged in developing mechanisms for tracking secondary students who receive articulated college credit as a result of the Career Pathways Articulation Agreements.”

- The district director of School and College Relations explained that the Career Pathways Consortium, which includes MDC staff and Miami Dade Public Schools (MDPS), is a strong partnership and meets annually to review and develop articulation agreements. The associate dean reported that there is no collaboration with secondary on curriculum development. However, the POS narrative submitted by MDC to FLDOE prior to the call and comments made by the district director of School and College Relations suggests that there is ongoing collaboration between secondary schools and MDC and curriculum is co-developed or reviewed by both secondary and postsecondary through the Career Pathways Consortium.

Addendum: In an email after reviewing the draft report, the MDC vice provost for Academic Affairs clarified what she and the district director of School and College Relations thought to be a miscommunication about the description of the relationship between the Career Pathways Consortium, local schools and MDC on POS. The vice provost commented that the associate dean was “speaking specifically about curriculum development and the fact that MDC faculty are solely responsible for the development of the college curriculum.” The district director of School and College Relations, however, was addressing specifically the collaboration around the Program of Study and the vice provost reported that the “communication avenues between MDPS, this consortium and MDC administrators is strong and will continue to get stronger.”

Programs of Study Overall

- MDC programs have been geared to support the area's multicultural and multilingual needs and has had to be creative in developing programs. The population in the area is transient so MDC has had to adapt to the community's changing needs over time. MDC has implemented a number of initiatives to attract local high school students, such as offering an Honor's College for high school valedictorians, employing pre-college advisors to meet with high school students and expanding dual enrollment options.

Definition of Program of Study

- The district director of School and College Relations defined a POS as the state template that includes the curriculum from the high school program, and a Career Pathway as the relationship and agreements in place to transition students between secondary and postsecondary levels in a program area.
- The associate dean stated that there is more specificity in the POS. The Associate Dean described the POS as the trunk of a tree and the branches as the different jobs or career paths offered within that POS at MDC. The POS is the major that leads to different path options at the college, some linear and others with different branches.

Review Process for Programs of Study

- There appears to be at least two types of CTE program reviews conducted each year for MDC programs. One is a college-wide Annual Effectiveness Review process for all professional schools and programs focused on student learning outcomes. The second consists of targeted reviews of five CTE programs conducted by the Career Pathways Consortium through Professional Learning Communities (PLC) to review selected POS and the articulation in this POS between secondary schools and MDC.

College-Wide Effectiveness Review

- The college-wide MDC Annual Effectiveness Review process is not inclusive of the Perkins performance measures. The review utilizes the data from an Annual Effectiveness Report, which is an assessment tool that is administered to students, graded by the teachers based on a rubric and analyzed to chart performance data.
- The reviews (which include enrollment, annual report data and course structure) are high level discussions held once a year with the Board of Directors for Departments/Schools (i.e. Advisory Councils) in a meeting format to discuss the following:
 - Relevant certifications
 - Additional certifications that will be beneficial to the business community and upcoming occupation demands
 - Potential programs that could be added to MDC
 - Feedback on current programs and garnering the perspectives from business partners

- These reviews are normally held in the spring. However, MDC is in the process of reevaluating the timeframe for reviews and adding more board members with expertise in the field. Currently, there are not separate advisory councils developed for each program in Architecture; the advisory council includes all of the Architecture, Interior Design and Building Construction Technology programs.

Career Pathways Consortium Targeted Program Review

- The Career Pathways Consortium agreement establishes that the Professional Learning Communities (PLC) target five programs per year to review the programs’ alignment, articulation and pathways, student outreach and marketing at orientations to keep students abreast about available articulations at MDC.
- The school district selects the five target programs based on what is high- skill, high- wage and which programs the district implements that are currently at MDC. Secondary and postsecondary members of the PLC vary, depending on which programs are targeted for review.

VIII. REQUIRED RESOLUTION ACTIVITIES

CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION

1. Corrective Action Plan – Miami Dade College is required to complete a Corrective Action Plan.
2. Action Plan – Miami Dade College is required to complete an Action Plan.

ADULT EDUCATION

3. Corrective Action Plan – Miami Dade College is required to complete a Corrective Action Plan.
4. Action Plan – Miami Dade College is required to complete an Action Plan.

IX. SUMMARY

Once the fieldwork is completed, including receipt of requested information, a draft report is forwarded to the provider for review. Comments are accepted and considered. The final report is completed, forwarded to the agency head with a copy to the appropriate parties and is posted on the department’s website at the following address: <http://fldoe.org/academics/career-adult-du/compliance>.

Finally, the division issues a closure notice to the agency head and designated contact person. This notice indicates all outstanding resolution items have been completed.

On behalf of the department, the monitoring team extends our appreciation to all participants in the Miami Dade College onsite monitoring visit. Special thanks is offered to Mrs. Sherry Joseph-Dutton and to Mr. Elias Reynoso for their participation and leadership during this process.

APPENDIX A

Miami Dade College
Career and Technical Education
Risk Matrix

Risk Scores Matrix for Colleges Receiving Career and Technical Education (CTE) Carl D. Perkins Grants					
Agency Name: MIAMI DADE COLLEGE					
Program type: CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION					
Target Year: 2014-2015					
Monitoring Year: 2016-2017					
Metric	Scaling	Point Value	Points Assigned	Weight	Total Metric Points
Total Perkins Budget Allocated Value	Upper Quartile	7	7	<u>X 10</u>	70
	Upper Middle	5			
	Lower Middle	3			
	Lower Quartile	1			
# Perkins Grants Value	4+	7	1	<u>X 8</u>	8
	3	5			
	2	3			
	1	1			
Perkins PIP Index Value	7.50 – 10.00	7	0	<u>X 8</u>	0
	5.00 – 7.49	5			
	2.50 – 4.99	3			
	0<index<2.50	1			
	0	0			
Perkins Director Change Value	Yes	7	0	<u>X 6</u>	42
	No	0			
Perkins Funds Remaining Point Value	Upper Quartile	7	0	<u>X 4</u>	0
	Upper Middle	5			
	Lower Middle	3			
	Lower Quartile	1			
	0	0			
OAG Findings Value	Upper Quartile	7	0	<u>X 4</u>	0
	Upper Middle	5			
	Lower Middle	3			
	Lower Quartile	1			
	0	0			
AGENCY RISK SCORE:					120

*Compliance monitoring last visit: CTE, Fall 2010

*Data sources used for calculations: Prior to July 1, 2015

Miami Dade College
Adult Education
Risk Matrix

Risk Scores Matrix for Colleges Receiving Adult Education (AE) Grants					
Agency Name: Miami Dade College					
Program type: ADULT EDUCATION					
Target Year: 2014-2015					
Monitoring Year: 2016-2017					
Metric	Scaling	Point Value	Points Assigned	Weight	Total Metric Points
Total AE Budget Allocated Value	Upper Quartile	7	7	X 10	70
	Upper Middle	5			
	Lower Middle	3			
	Lower Quartile	1			
# AE Grants Value	4+	7	3	X 8	24
	3	5			
	2	3			
	1	1			
AE Director Change Value	Yes	7	0	X 6	0
	No	0			
AE Funds Remaining Point Value	Upper Quartile	7	3	X 4	12
	Upper Middle	5			
	Lower Middle	3			
	Lower Quartile	1			
	0	0			
OAG Findings Value	Upper Quartile	7	0	X 4	0
	Upper Middle	5			
	Lower Middle	3			
	Lower Quartile	1			
	0	0			
AGENCY RISK SCORE:					106

*Compliance monitoring last visit: AE, Fall 2010

*Data sources used for calculations: Prior to July 1, 2015

APPENDIX B

Miami Dade College
Resolution Action Plan

Corrective Action(s) And/or Action(s)	Action or Strategy to Address Findings or Concerns	Agency Response	Person Responsible	Projected Date of Completion and status
<p>Finding D1: The equipment inventory listing did not follow the rules and guidelines as specified in EDGAR (34 CFR 80.32 (d)(1)) and the UGG (200.313). At multiple CTE locations throughout the college the monitoring team observed numerous pieces of equipment/inventory that was not in the specified classroom or campus locations according to the provided inventory lists.</p> <p>Dell Inspiron laptops purchased at North Campus with EL Civics funds were included in the inventory listings as AGE grant purchases. In addition, at the time of our visit to North Campus the laptops were not located at the campus as stated on the inventory listing. They were later found at two off campus ESOL locations.</p> <p>Multiple pieces of CTE equipment at the Wolfson campus were located in different classrooms other than what was stated on the inventory listing.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Wolfson Campus, room 2303 had multiple Dell Optiplex computers that were listed as being located in room 2318. ▪ Wolfson Campus, room 8314 had multiple WACOM systems that 	<p>Corrective Action D1: The equipment inventory listings must follow the rules and guidelines as specified in EDGAR (34 CFR 80.32(d)(1)) and the UGG (200.313). Equipment/inventory listings must be updated to reflect its current location and/or custodian. A property transfer form must be used when moving equipment/inventory to reflect an items current location.</p>	<p>MDC will request Property Transfer Form and follow guidelines identified in EDGAR (34 CFR 80.32 (d)(1)) and the UGG (200.313). The Equipment Inventory listings with correct locations will be completed by April 10, 2017.</p>	<p>Elias Reynoso</p>	<p>April 10, 2017</p>

<p>were listed as being located in room 7180.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Wolfson Campus, room 7180 had additional WACOM systems that were listed as being located in room 8314. ○ Aviation equipment/inventory located at the Miami International Airport and the Miami Executive Airport is listed as being at the Homestead Campus. 				
<p>Finding H1: Numerous AE semiannual certifications and time and effort reports were missing the appropriate signatures and/or dates. UGG (200.430), FLDOE Green Book (Personnel Cost- Time Distribution, Section C-19)</p>	<p>Corrective Action H1: Employee semi-annual certifications and time and effort reports must be signed and dated by the employee and supervisor after the work has been performed. UGG (200.430), FLDOE Green Book (Personnel Cost- Time Distribution, Section C-19).</p>	<p>MDC will identify the Adult Education semi-annual certification reporting process and make correction to meet UGG (200.430), FLDOE Green Book (Personnel Cost-Time Distribution, Section c-19) guidelines and ensure all certification forms are signed and dated by employee and supervisor once work has been performed</p>	<p>Elias Reynoso</p>	<p>April 10, 2017</p>
<p>Plan submitted by (name and title): Elias Reynoso, director, Career and Technical Education Date: 3/22/2017</p> <p>Plan accepted by: Michael Swift, program specialist, FLDOE Date: 3/23/2017</p>				
<p>Status of Action Plan (to be completed by FLDOE staff): 3/23/2017 - Ongoing. The first progress update will be requested one month from submission of this report.</p>				
<p>Date: 3/23/2017</p>	<p>Status of Plan Completion: Ongoing</p>			

ATTACHMENT

Miami Dade College Highlights of Adult Education and Career and Technical Education programs

OVERVIEW

Over the course of 50 years, Miami Dade College (MDC) has admitted more than two million students and formed the nation's most diverse student body. Today, MDC enrolls the largest number of undergraduates in the United States, with more than 160,000 students — from students who enroll right out of high school to those wishing to enhance their professional careers and enrich their personal lives. MDC is a majority-minority institution, with an enrollment that is 72 percent Hispanic, 16 percent black non-Hispanic and seven percent white non-Hispanic. Sixty-six percent of MDC students are classified as low-income, and 45 percent live below the federal poverty level.

As the only community college serving the 2.6 million residents of Miami-Dade County, Florida, MDC provides workforce-responsive education and training at eight campuses strategically located throughout the 2,000-square-mile county area. MDC's academic programs offer a range of degree pathways that prepare students to enter the modern workforce or pursue higher educational goals. Credentials include bachelor's degrees, associate's degrees, and a variety of college-credit certificates and noncredit workforce certifications. The College encourages companies and organizations to work with it to develop a reliable source of talent that will contribute to the economic well-being of the community.

The MDC Strategic Plan for 2015–2020 includes the College's mission statement: "As Democracy's College, Miami Dade College changes lives through accessible, high-quality teaching and learning experiences. The College embraces its responsibility to serve as an economic, cultural, and civic leader for the advancement of our diverse global community." In addition, the Strategic Plan articulates the College's vision "to be the recognized leader in student learning, achievement, and success while enriching our community."

ADULT EDUCATION

MDC serves 10,000 students annually in its [Adult Education](#) programs. Approximately, 80 percent of those individuals are in ESOL and Citizenship classes and 20 percent are enrolled in ABE and GED® preparation classes. Adult Education Classes are offered on seven of the college campuses and 10 off campus sites around Miami Dade County. Historically, Miami Dade College averages more than 400 [GED® graduates](#) annually. During the 2015-2016 year, 14 ESOL students transitioned directly into the MDC Honors Program.

ESOL and GED students of the School of Continuing Education and Professional Development at the MDC InterAmerican Campus were selected for inclusion in the 2016 adult learner essay book *Going Places*, published by the Florida Literacy Coalition (http://news.mdc.edu/press_release/miami-dade-college-adult-education-students-featured-in-essay-book-going-places/).

MDC is proud to be a recipient of the [High School Equivalency Program \(HEP\) Grant](#) from the U.S. Department of Education. This grant is awarded to help students who currently work (or have worked) in agriculture obtain their GED®. The grant covers the costs of textbooks, testing fees and childcare.

All Adult Education students receive direct career advisement and transition guidance to postsecondary education from the Career Readiness Advisors (CRAs). CRAs guide students through an effective decision-making process regarding career-setting goals, education, transfer, employment opportunities and promotions. Incorporation of recognized best practices, such as student orientations and goal setting using Florida’s “My Career Shines” are conducted by CRAs. Professional development opportunities for instructors and CRAs are ongoing. Miami Dade College Adult Education students are able to take advantage of employment opportunities from the CareerSource South Florida Job Placement Specialists who inform the CRAs of job openings and job fairs.

CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION

MDC offers a myriad of CTE programs that are aligned with high demand workforce needs. These programs are designed to prepare completers for the jobs of today while also keeping current with the industry in anticipation of the jobs of tomorrow.

With the recent launch of new CTE programs like the Associate in Science (AS) in Fashion Design and Merchandising, located within the [Miami Fashion Institute](#), and a College Credit Certificate and AS in Business Intelligence leading to a Bachelor of Science (BS) in Data Analytics (<http://news.mdc.edu/wp-content/uploads/2016/02/Miami-Dade-College-to-offer-states-first-undergraduate-big-data-degree- - Miami-Herald.pdf>), MDC is attuned to the changing economic landscape in Miami and enjoys close ties with business and industry. MDC has a strong presence in its community, and our CTE advisory committee members are active and provide great insight to the needs of the training programs preparing their future workforce.

Recognizing the ever-changing education and economic environment, MDC has embarked upon an academic reorganization with the intent of allowing CTE to grow and flourish. President Padron stated, *“While this will be a significant shift from the current campus reporting structure for our workforce programs, it will allow us as an institution to provide increased and consistent college-wide support for the respective programs.”* This is an exciting time for CTE programs at the college. This includes the creation of a new position for a Vice Provost for Academic Schools and the introduction of Academic School Deans in the following Academic Schools:

- School of Global Business
- School of Education
- School of Emerging Technologies and Design
- School of Health Sciences
- School of Nursing
- School of Justice, Public Safety & Law Studies
- School of Science

MDC is also participating in the Right Signals Initiative in partnership with the Association of Community Colleges and focusing on providing prospective and current students with clear and consistent messaging about how CTE programs are structured allowing a student to “stack” credentials. [Understanding Your Credentials](#) is a new website intended to help guide students in making good decisions about program and course selection. This School of Education [credential map](#) is an example of an advising and marketing tool intended to help students understand the credential landscape. Additionally, the [academic program websites](#) have been recently restructured and enhanced to provide more and better information as prospective students are making choices about their future career prospects.

Defined during the strategic planning development and implementation process, an initiative called Responsive Academic Program Development has launched with the aim of ensuring new academic programs are responsive to emerging industry needs. Through careful analysis of workforce projections reported by the Florida Department of Economic Opportunity and recognition of the targeted industries identified by the [Beacon Council](#), MDC actively engages with new and growing employers in the Miami area to be sure they have the workforce necessary to operate. In addition, the Hub for Innovative Academic Education or HIVE was created to identify mechanisms for academic innovation.

Some of the new and innovating program offerings at MDC are housed with the Miami Animation and Game Design Complex ([MAGIC](#)). A growing new program in terms of student enrollment, the inaugural student cohort is slated to graduate this semester. Strong [business partnerships](#) with companies like Alienware, Univision Communications and Discovery Latin America provide students with key industry connections through various engagement opportunities, internships and mentorships.

Recently, MDC inducted retired Deputy Fire Chief, City of Miami, Edward Pidermann, and Police Director for the Miami-Dade Police Department, Juan J. Perez, into its [Alumni Hall of Fame](#). Other 2016 recipients include professionals across various industries - including business, law, medicine and public safety - many of whom graduated from a MDC CTE program. All of these illustrious alumni are proud to identify as being a part of the MDC community.

The MDC Mission states: *As democracy's college, Miami Dade College changes lives through accessible, high-quality teaching and learning experiences. The College embraces its responsibility to serve as an economic, cultural and civic leader for the advancement of our diverse global community.* With strong cultural roots in the community college open-access mission, MDC is offering the Miami community, with all its rich diversity, opportunities that would otherwise be inaccessible. These opportunities are delivered with the conviction that "[it takes one](#)" to inspire, cultivate and motivate the next change making entrepreneur or nurse or law enforcement officer that will make our world, community, city and college a better place.